[Shri M. M. Jacob]

Force Act, 1949, a copy (in English and Hindi) of the Ministry of Home Affairs Notification G. S. R. No. 54 dated the 26th January, 1991, publishing the Indo-Tibetan Border Police, Additional Deputy Inspector General (Engineer) Recruitment Rules, 1990 [Placed in Library. *See* No. LT 130/91]

STATEMENT ON INDUSTRIAL POLICY

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri P. K. Thungon (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra): Madam, I have a point of order.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): If he is laying the new Industrial Policy, then, I have a point of order.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Madam, I have a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Thungon, please, just a minute. Let me handle the points of order.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Madam, as I mentioned in the morning.....

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, whom are you allowing?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: One by one I will allow everybody. Let him speak. Then I will allow you, I will allow him, I will allow everybody. But let me first handle one point of order.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Madam, earlier also a statement on the Industrial Policy was made, and clarifications were allowed to be sought. Now they want to take away our right. As such, after the statement is made we should be allowed to ask clarifications on this issue. Without that he should not be allowed to lay it on the Table.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your point of order, Mr. Dipen Ghosh?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: It has been announced that Mr. P. K. Thungon would lay on the Table a statement on the Industrial Policy. The Industrial Policy is such a matter, a serious matter which is being talked about in the newspapers all these days. It is related to the entire economic approach of the new Government. So, if it is merely laid on the Table, unless a substantive motion is brought to have a discussion, as the procedure stands, Madam,...

..THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB): This is only laying the paper. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just let everybody speak so that we can finish it fast. Okay, agreed.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: My point is that it is a method of taking away the right of Rajya Sabha Members to have a debate and discussion on this Policy and to approve it or disapprove it. So, I would ask the Government through you that this policy should be read out in the House and immediately thereafter a full-fledged debate on it should follow.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I would like to know under what Rule of Procedure this policy statement is being laid on the Table of the House. Rule 251 governs statement by a Minister. A Minister has to make a statement under Rule 251. He cannot lay it. A discussion on the industrial policy statement that was made last time I think, we all missed this point. Therefore, my point is that the Minister should make the Statement. He cannot lay the statement. That will give us an opportunity to discuss the statement. Now despite the fact that I belonged to the ruling party at that time, I regret very much that we could not get an opportunity at that point of time to discuss the Industrial Policy Resolution which had been tabled by the then Government. This was despite the fact that many of us were pressing that

we must have a discussion on it, but we could not have a discussion on it. Considering the schedule of this House and the fact that we are going in recess after the 2nd of August, it appears to me that until we are very alert about it, a discussion on this policy statement is also going to go by default. We don't want this thing to happen. It is a major policy of the Government and we must have time to be able to discuss it and make our comment on it.

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra): I am also on the same point. The hon. Member has rightly brought out the point that under Rule 251 it cannot be laid, but a statement has to be made on it. Now that you have permitted him and it is on the agenda paper, what we want is a discussion during this session. Many Members had given notices. A cognizance should be taken of their notices. I have also requested the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs. He has suggested a day should be found out to discuss the industrial policy.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर (उत्तर प्रदेश): मैं उपने दल की तरफ से यह बात कहना चाहता हूं कि जब इस प्रकार के महत्वपूर्ण वक्तव्य दिये जाते हैं या कोई नीति संबंध बात होती है तो जैसा मेरे साथियों ने कहा है, उस पर डिसकशन होना है । इसलिए मैं मंत्री महोदय से पूछना चाहूंगा कि इस पद्धति से उन्होंने डिपार्चर क्यों किया है ? मुझे लगता है कि इस पर शायद वे बहस नहीं करना चाहते हैं आज ही बजट आने वाला है और आज ही इकट्ठा इसको रखा गया है, क्यों रखा गया है, हम नहीं जानते । दूसरे मैं आपके माध्यम से यह आश्वासन चाहूंगा कि इस संबंध में सरकार कौन सी पद्धति अपनाना चाहती है, क्या वे इसको सबस्टेंटिव मोशन से डिसकशन करना चाहेंगे या किसी एक दिन इस डिसकशन करेंगे ? मैं चाहूंगा कि इस पर पूरा डिसकशन सबस्टेंटिव मोशन के साथ होना चाहिए ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Everybody is raising the same thing. You want to say the same thing.

श्री जगदीश प्रसाद माथुर : सबसे पहले मंत्री महोदय यह बात जवाब दें कि जो सामान्य पद्धति उससे उन्होंने डिपार्चर क्यों किया ?

उपसभापति : माथुर साहब, इस पर डिसकशन होगा । Let me first tell you that this statement is not a statement which a Minister comes and gives. (*Interruptions*). Just a minute. Let me explain, you wanted an explanation, but you don't want to hear. It contains the entire industrial policy. Now, we have constraint of time. We have got a discussion on the Railway Budget and also on the General Budget and we have to finish it by 31st of this month. I will ask the Minister and the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs to find time for a discussion on the Industrial Policy also. I assure you that the Members' right to ask clarifications on any statement is not going to be curtailed. Nobody is going to curtail your right of discussion also.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: It is a very important policy announcement of the Government. So, we want a full-fledged discussion on it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't interrupt. I think it is a very bad habit. You were not the only one who raised this issue. Mr. Jagesh Desai also raised this issue. I have to speak for every one, who has spoken on this question. Have a little patience. Mr. Jagesh Desai wanted to have clarifications. I said he or anybody who wants clarifications can do so, You want a discussion. We will request the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs to discuss the Industrial Policy. If you feel it is important, then we will find time and discuss it. Just now let us go ahead with the other work.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Will he assure the House that it will be discussed and that time for it will be allotted by the BAC?

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Madam, we are more concerned than the hon. Members to have a discussion on the subject because it is a very important document. I agree with them that we should have

[Shri M. M. Jacob]

a discussion on it. Somehow I will find time and date for it in the Business Advisory Committee meeting. Mr. Ghosh is also a Member of the Committee and he will also be there.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: In the Business Advisory Committee we will fix up a date for the debate. As the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs you assure us.... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Before the House adjourns in the first week of August, 1991, you fix up a date for the debate. ... (*Interruptions*).

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह : महोदया. ...(व्यवधान)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Order. I cannot hear you.

मुझे उनकी बात सुनने दीजिये।

I have given my ruling. The Minister for Parliamentary Affairs has given an assurance that they will fix up a time and date for the debate. Now, I will take up announcement.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: What about my point of order? May I know whether it has been allowed or withdrawn?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is a different kind of statement. It is the entire industrial policy which he is laying.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: How is it different. It is a statement of the Minister on Industrial Policy.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: It is a paper relating to the statement.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: No. I am very clear about it. It is not permissible under the rules. Madam, you have to give a ruling on my point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay. Let me find out what is he doing?

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह : उपसभापति महोदया (व्यवधान)...

उपसभापति : एक मिनट बैठिये, अभी नहीं। मुझे मंत्री जी से बात करने दीजिए Mr. Thungon, are you laying the Industrial Policy document or only a statement?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF INDUSTRY (SHRI P. K. THUNGON): Policy statement.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, he is making a statement on Industrial Policy. It cannot be laid on the Table.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Under rule 251, it cannot be laid on the Table.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is an Industrial Policy document. It is not a statement .... (*Interruptions*)....

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It is a statement.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan): Madam, you have to defend our right.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: My right is to defend everyone.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, as it is here, it cannot be laid on the Table. ... (*Interruptions*)....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Order please.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: It is a policy document.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He cannot read it out.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, please look into rule 251. Under this rule, it cannot be laid on the Table.

SHRI JAGESH DEASI: Our right is to seek clarifications on the statement. Last time also it happened like this.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: Madam, I can assure the hon. Members....*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. Please sit down. Let me hear, what the Minister is saying...*(Interruptions)*... You may not want to hear anything in this House. But I want to hear everyone who speaks here.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: Madam, if the hon. Members are prepared to hear me, we do not mind having a full-scale discussion on it...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It is entirely up to the House to decide about it but it is not up to the Minister...*(Interruptions)*... He is not doing us a favour.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Under rule 251, it cannot be laid on the Table.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: We take serious objection to the expression of the Minister. What does he mean by saying "we do not mind..." He says he does not mind. Are we here in this House at their mercy?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, will you please sit down? *(Interruptions)*. Just a minute.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: It can be done tomorrow.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, let it be done tomorrow, followed by a discussion. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI RAM AWADHESH SINGH: This is an important issue.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know it is important. That is why I am allowing so much time on it. Just listen to me. A Minister can lay a document on the Table. He is in his right to do that. It is not just a simple statement which you demand in the House. It is a complete policy document, industrial policy document, which he cannot read in the House. We do not have so much time. But definitely he has given an assurance that when we find time, we are going to discuss it. And I am allowing him to lay it on the Table. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, it is not covered by the rules. *(Interruptions)*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is no wrong procedure. I am within my right to allow a Minister to lay any document on the Table of the House. I am within my right. *(Interruptions)*. I have allowed him. That matter is over.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, this is a very important matter of procedure.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I can allow him to lay a document on the Table. It is a document. You should understand. You are a senior Member.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: What does the supplementary agenda say?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: There have been many occasions on which such massive policy documents have been laid on the Table. If you want a discussion, if the entire House desires it, I will permit a discussion when the time is found by the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, But, just now, the matter is closed. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN (Maharashtra): We have a right to seek clarifications.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No clarification today. There is no time. I cannot permit.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: What does the order paper say?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is not a one-page document.*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Madam, it is a document. *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, the order paper says it is a statement.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: A document is also a statement.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: I am on a point of order. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: It is a statement. It is not a document.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have other businesses to do. I do not want to listen to anything more on this. I am not allowing.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Under what rule is he laying it on the Table?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Under rule 250.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: No. Rule 250 is not the rule.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: "Papers Laid on the Table". (*Interruptions*). I have said it is within my right to allow him to lay any paper, whether it is a policy document or a statement. I can allow him. I am protecting your right... (*Interruptions*). If you are not interested, you can go out of the House. I am not bothered. If you are not interested.... (*Interruptions*). Please do not interrupt. I have permitted him and I am in my right to permit him.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: That is not covered by the rules.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That matter is closed.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your point of order? (*Interruptions*).

आप बैठिये । कोई प्रोसीजर गलत नहीं है । आप मेरी रूलिंग के बाद खड़े हो रहे हैं यह गलत प्रोसीजर है मेरी रूलिंग के बाद आप खड़े हो रहे हैं यह बहुत गलत प्रोसीजर है (व्यवधान) आप बैठे जाइये । (व्यवधान)

Anybody speaking without any permission will not be recorded. After my ruling, if anybody speaks without my permission it is out of procedure. Please sit down. (Interruption). Iam not allowing him. Mr. Salaria, I am not allowing you. You can speak. But it will not go on record.

SHRI SHABBIR AHMAD SALARIA (Jammu and Kashmir):*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please don't argue. (*Interruptions*). Please sit down. Mr. Solaria, please sit down. (*Interruptions*)... I don't know for what you come here. It is for you to see for what you come here. According to me, you come here to see that the House runs in order. You don't come here to create disorder. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, my point of order is very simple and direct and I want a specific ruling from you. We have been given the supplementary Agenda which clearly says, "Shri P. K. Thungon to lay on the Table a statement in English and Hindi on the Industrial Policy." Now Madam according to the Rules of Business of Rajya Sabha, a statement by the Minister can be made under rule 251. (*Interruptions*). Rule 251 says it clearly and I want your ruling on that. (*Interruptions*). Madam, I want your attention. Rule 251 says, "a statement may be made by a Minister on a matter of public importance with the consent of the Chairman, but no question shall be asked at the time the statement is made." (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: So no question should be asked.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Let me complete, Madam. But the statement can be made, it cannot be laid.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: May be made. It is not said that statement should be made only. See, the English language (*Interruptions*)... He can lay it also. We have done it so many times. Don't be so ignorant. We have done it in the past If you want to make it an issue, it is up to you. We have done it in the past and

*Not recorded.

I have allowed him. Please let me make another announcement.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, let my point of order go on record.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN. Rule 250 and rule 251 are clear and it is within the right of the Chairman to permit. I am in the Chair and I have permitted him.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, Rule 250 says, "All papers and documents laid on the Table shall be considered public". Is it a document or a statement?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him finish. Can you be heard when he is speaking?

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: Madam, if it is a document, then why do you say a statement can be laid on the Table of the House?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That is a mistake.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Let the statement be corrected if it is a mistake. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: Madam, I beg to lay on the Table a statement (in English and Hindi) on Industrial Policy. [Placed in Library. *See* No. LT 124/91]

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: आप भी गलती कर सकते हैं दुनिया में That matter is over.

LEAVE OF ABSENCE

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have to make an announcement. I have to inform the Members that the Chairman has received a letter from Shri R. K. Narayan stating that he is not well and he is unable to attend the current Session. The Chairman has also received a letter from Chaudhary Harmohan Singh, stating that he has met with an accident and has been hospitalised and is unable to attend the current Session. Both the Members have requested for grant of leave of absence from all the sittings of the House during the current Session.

Is it the pleasure of the House that permission be granted to Shri R. K. Narayan and Chaudhary Harmohan Singh for remaining absent from all meetings of the House during the current Session?

(*No hon. Member dissented*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Permission to remain absent is granted.

MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE SPICES BOARD

THE MINISTER OF STATE (INDEPENDENT CHARGE) OF THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE (SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM): Madam Deputy Chairman, I move:

> "That in pursuance of clause (b) of sub-section (3) of section 3 of the Spices Board Act, 1986 (10 of 1986) read with rule 5(2) of the Spices Board (Amendment) Rules, 1987, this House do proceed to elect in such manner, as the Chairman may direct, one member from among the members of the House, to be a member of the Spices Board."

The question was put and the motion was adopted.

MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE COFFEE BOARD

THE MINISTER OF STATE (INDEPENDENT CHARGE) OF THE MINISTRY OF COMMERCE (SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM): Madam Deputy Chairman, I move:

> "That in pursuance of clause (b) of sub-section (2) of section 4 of the Coffee Act, 1942 (7 of 1942) read with sub-rule (2) of rule 4 of the Coffee Rules, 1955, this House do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Chairman may direct, one